

**MARIEMONT ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
REGULAR MEETING  
JUNE 20, 2022**

Mayor Brown called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. Present were Mayor Brown, Mr. Bentley, Mr. Ayer, Dr. Lewis and Mr. Lockhart. Building/Zoning Official Mr. Holloway was also present.

Mr. Lockhart moved, seconded by Mr. Bentley to approve the minutes as written for May 16, 2022. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

An Application from the Mariemont Preservation Foundation, for the property located at 3915 Plainville Rd. OH 45227 (“Ferris House”) to replace a 3-tab asphalt shingle with a dimensional asphalt shingle was presented. Mayor Brown said ARB does not have a voting quorum for this application due to Dr. Lewis and Mr. Lockhart being Trustees for MPF – they need to recuse themselves from the vote. Mr. Ayer moved, seconded by Dr. Lewis to table the matter. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

An application from GR Investments of Cincinnati LTD to replace 5 garage doors with 16-panel aluminum doors for the associated properties located at 3912-20 on Beech St was presented. The garages are at the intersection of Lane B and C.

**For Item 2:**

**§ 151.075 HISTORIC DISTRICT**

(H)(1) *Limitations on issuance of building and demolition permits.* No construction, reconstruction, alteration demolition, or removal of any structure or significant exterior architectural feature, including painting and staining, and including signage, thereof to any listed landmark structure or any other building within a historic district shall be undertaken prior to obtaining a certificate of appropriateness from the Architectural Review Board (see §§ [151.021\(E\)](#) and [151.025](#)) and a permit from the Building Commissioner, if appropriate.

(H)(2) *Regulations governing site modifications: Standards for review: design requirements for certificate of appropriateness.* The Architectural Review Board, in deciding whether to issue a certificate of appropriateness, shall determine that the application under consideration promotes, preserves, and enhances the distinctive historical integrity of the landmark structure as set forth in division (F) above, as well as the historical village character of the community and would not be at variance with existing structures within that portion of the district in which the structure is or is proposed to be located. In conducting its review, the Board shall make examination and give consideration to the elements of the application including, but not necessarily limited to:

(h) Buildings shall have exterior material of painted wood, material that simulates painted wood, brick, stucco, stones, or stone masonry and take into consideration texture, color, and compatibility among various elements of the structure. The exterior color of all landmark structures shall be guided by the Village Historic Color Guidelines;

- (i) Roof treatment shall be of the same type and form and the same or similar color and exterior material as found on the existing building, or brought into conformity with division (H)(2)(f) above

**Specific for Item 2:**

**Findings of the Building Department:**

The 5-family unit from 3912-3920 Beech St. is part of the Clinton MacKenzie Buildings, which are defined as 3902-3946 Beech Street, north of Chestnut, east side; and are landmark structures as defined in Mariemont Village code ordinance section 151.075 (F) (1) and thus part of the Historical District.

**150.01 INTERNATIONAL PROPERTY MAINTENANCE CODE**

(B) The following shall apply to the Historic District only.

- (4) All exterior building components shall be in conformance with approved colors in historic districts.
- (5) Garage doors shall be 16-panel wood or aluminum painted with approved dark brown color.

**§ 151.075 HISTORIC DISTRICT**

(k) Accessory buildings exceeding 100 square feet of floor area shall be of the same architectural style and same exterior material as the main building or a reasonable reconstructed facsimile of the original historic structure that previously existed on the lot; however, all garage replacements and improvements shall conform to the following:

- 1. All replacement garage doors must be a solid 16 panel steel door for a single car garage; and
- 2. Garages and their doors for each specific landmark structure shall be guided by the color requirements of the Architectural Review Board available in the Col. Donald L. Shanks Municipal Building

There are a number of contradictions in our Village Ordinances related to materials and colors for the garages associated with Historical District properties.

Additional details on the choice of shingle and sample shingle are available upon request as well as information on the garage door and color palette for the garage and MacKenize Buildings.

Mr. Holloway presented many pictures of the applicant's garage doors and others that are in the area.

Mr. Matt Jackson, representative for GR Investments, said the garage doors are the original doors from 1926. Presently, they are facing super inflated costs for materials and lengthy lead times. With the contradictory information in the code, they were informed that they needed to come before ARB though what they are presenting is the same as the garage directly next to theirs. Different style with windows and hardware will add a significant price increase (\$600.00) cost per door and take longer to get the materials. They repaired the doors in 2006 and it was expensive. The doors are warped and need to be replaced.

Ms. Betty Clingerman, Representative of the Historical District Committee for Mariemont Preservation Foundation, said they are working on architectural features that need to be replaced as there are several 100-year-old buildings. But it is a work in progress. She presented information she had found on different garage doors that had the carriage feel, look and windows, such as Wayne Dalton. With the carriage hardware it gives more of a feel of the original materials.

Mr. Ayer said the roof that was put on the garage in 2015 is charcoal. On one hand he would like to see the garage color consistent with the surrounding brown paint, but with the roof being a predominant feature, he is not sure that brown would look the best and asked if the charcoal color would be permitted. Mr. Jackson said they submitted a charcoal color to match the roof or an almond color. Samples were provided with the application. There are two issues to decide: (1) the type of door and (2) color of the door. Mr. Ayer said the charcoal roof is going to be there for 15 more years and being a dominant feature not abutting to any other building given the existing conditions he believes the charcoal would look the best.

Mr. Ayer moved, seconded by Mr. Bentley to approve the charcoal door trim. Mr. Ayer withdrew his motion to allow for more discussion. Discussion ensued regarding the type of doors in the area and color schemes. It would not be consistent with others in the area to paint it charcoal, but it would not look ideal to paint the doors brown with a charcoal roof. ARB members talked of righting the ship while maintaining a level of consistency with a goal of continuity.

Mayor Brown moved, seconded by Mr. Bentley to require the replacement doors be three panel doors with the top panel being lighted panel to replicate a carriage door style. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

Discussion moved to the color of the door. Mr. Jackson stated it was a moot point as they would not be replacing the doors for the extra cost. It is frustrating when clearly there has been a standard set for 16 panels which is being overridden for the idea of what the ARB wants to get back to. If that is the case, then revise the code.

Mayor Brown said the applicant can appeal the decision.

The meeting adjourned at 7:05 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Mr. Brad Lockhart  
Secretary