

**MARIEMONT ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
APRIL 19, 2011**

Mr. Malone called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Present were Mr. Raeon, Mr. Bruggeman and Mr. Stegman. Mr. Thomas and Ms. Schomberg were not present. Building Commissioner Dennis Malone was also present.

The first agenda item was the election of Chairman, Vice-Chairman and Secretary.

Mr. Stegman moved seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to nominate Mr. Raeon as Chairman. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to nominate Mr. Bruggeman as Vice-Chairman. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to nominate Mr. Stegman as Secretary. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

The first request was for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Eric and Angela Forsyth, 8 Denny Place for color changes to stucco and wood trim at subject property. Building Commissioner Malone said he took the color samples over to the house and the proposed paint color to the stucco is virtually the same color. The main change would be to the trim of the house. Mrs. Forsyth said they were going to test paint the windows white to see if the paint will stay. If the paint stays with the material then they want to paint the windows white to match the wooden trim. She passed around the samples of the paint color to the members of the ARB. Mr. Raeon asked if the colors being suggested are allowed. Building Commissioner Malone said they are not listed per se in the ARB guidelines. The guidelines call for the stucco to be white and how it came to be beige he has no idea because there is nothing recorded. The guidelines are specific to each address with #1 and #8 Denny Place being the same. The original stipulations call for dark trim for this particular property. The approach that ARB has taken in the past is as long as someone conforms to this they could go ahead without ARB intervention. If there is a change then it needs to be approved by ARB. Mrs. Forsyth said they also want to put in shutters and paint them black. She noted that #1 Denny Place presently has shutters. They would put shutters up to match the same as #1 Denny. Building Commissioner Malone said that would need to be a separate application from the paint colors because that would be a major change to the architecture of the house. Mrs. Forsyth said she assumed the shutters were taken off at some point since the other house has them. Building Commissioner Malone said the important consideration that the Board has is to deal with changes to the current arrangement. Mr. Bruggeman said he is worried that the detail of the trim will be lost with a lighter color. The guidelines actually in the zoning call for paints to emulate the color of the wood. Mr. Stegman asked if the bookend house #1 Denny conforms to the guidelines. Building Commissioner said as far as he knows or it is very close. Mrs. Forsyth said she understood the concern about the lighter trim color but she wants to try to make her house look fresh. The house is shaded by a lot of trees and she wanted to brighten it up. If the Board wants a darker trim for contrast she can look for that. Mr. Stegman said the street is an historic street and the Village has dedicated time and resources to try to get back to where we started. He is not sure as a Board what leeway they have.

After further discussion it was decided that the applicant would come back in May 2011 to address the erection of shutters. Mrs. Forsyth said they are trying to paint ASAP because they

are working with their neighbor and using the same painters. It was agreed to grandfather the pre-existing color of the stucco. Mr. Bruggeman moved, seconded by Mr. Stegman to approve the existing color and the dark brown trim as stated in the approved guidelines. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

The second request was for a Certificate of Appropriateness by David Robisch, 3 Sheldon Close, for replacement fence at subject property. Building Commissioner Malone said the word replacement is misleading. A new picket fence is going to be erected to contain the dog. The present stockade fence was previously approved. Mr. Bruggeman said after driving around and looking at other fences the picket fence seems to fit into the neighborhood. He asked if the fence needs to be painted. Building Commissioner Malone said the owner is going to let it weather gray to match the stockade fence. Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

The third request was for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Carole Demaret, 2 Denny Place, for proposed addition at rear of existing property. The applicant is out of town on vacation. Building Commissioner Malone said he left it on the agenda but if there is any objection to the request it should be tabled and heard at the May meeting. With the house being stone all the way around it is virtually impossible to match the stone. The design is nicely detailed and fits in nicely with the architecture that is there presently. He asked that the applicant share with the abutting neighbors a copy of the plans. Ms. Betty Rhoads, 3 Denny Place, said she had not yet seen the plans. Mr. Raeon said from a color standpoint it appears more modern than traditional. He is curious how the color scheme fits with the architectural standards. Mr. Stegman said he did not know how the color scheme came to be. He would like to suggest to the applicant if they are open to it is to replace the existing clapboard with shake and do the whole new addition in shake in a darker color. Mr. Raeon said it is a treasure of a street. Mr. Bruggeman said it is a sensible addition in terms of material contrast with the stone. It almost looks historic. Mr. Raeon said this is a street where ARB has a lot less flexibility than maybe in other areas. It is such an important street that we want to keep the integrity. We do not mind contrast but from a color and materials perspective it just does not seem to fit. Mr. Bruggeman said he needs to go view the street. Ms. Rhoades said she was amazed at the size of the addition. She said she is a purist and would prefer that the addition look like it has been there since the beginning. It is nice and well done but it looks like living in jolly England and then New England. Building Commissioner Malone said he will pass the observations onto the applicant and invite them back in May to present color and siding. He is going to encourage them to have a neighborhood chat.

The fourth request was for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Mary Cordill, 3855 Oak Street, for wrought iron gate currently installed at entry sidewalk. Building Commissioner Malone said the gate was installed without benefit of ARB approval or a building permit. The applicant is in Florida. She is asking for retroactive approval of the gate and if it is not approved she will have to remove it. To complicate matters there is a for sale sign in the front yard. Mr. Raeon said it fits nice and it is a rich improvement. It is surrounded by tall bushes and it frames the entry way. Building Commissioner Malone said he found it to be acceptable and it is a quality installation. He does not think it harms or impinges the neighbors. Mr. Bruggeman moved, seconded by Mr. Stegman to approve the design and installation of the gate. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

Mr. Raeon asked about the installation of the fence at the Tot Lot by the Mariemont PreSchool Parents. He thought that was part of the purview of the ARB. Building Commissioner Malone said that is right. From his standpoint it has been a mysterious project. Mr. Raeon said

the fence is up which surprised the Building Commissioner. There are signs on the fence instructing people to keep off. He has seen some of the Maintenance personnel in the area. He asked if there was a shared expense with the Village by Mariemont PreSchool Parents. Mrs. Van Pelt said she believed it was shared 50/50 with the Village. It went through the Health and Recreation Committee of Council which recommended the fence installation. It was then approved by Council. Mr. Raeon said he knows from a safety standpoint that was a concern of parents. On the other hand it is a great climbing fence. He asked if there are any plans for landscaping so the contrast is not so stark. Building Commissioner Malone said he did not know the answer to that. Mr. Raeon said safety is certainly part of the zoning code but on the other hand he hates to see people forgo coming before the ARB which could set a precedent. Building Commissioner Malone agreed. Mr. Raeon said he would like to see Council consult the staff on decisions such as these. There is not an objection to taking the fence down but it could have been enhanced. He wanted to go on record that ARB is concerned that Council did not approach staff which would have referred the matter to ARB. It surprises him that Council did this but with new members they may not have been familiar with some of the ARB requirements. He is going to contact Mr. Andrews and Louise Schomberg and encourage them to discuss this with Council and potentially maybe it can be softened a little bit.

Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to accept the minutes as written for August 17, 2010. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:26 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Mike Stegman
Secretary