

**MARIEMONT ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
DECEMBER 13, 2021**

Mayor Brown called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Present were Mr. Kintner, Dr. Lewis and Mayor Brown. Mr. Bentley and Mr. Lockhart. Mr. Wren arrived at 5:45 p.m. Building/Zoning Official Mr. Holloway was also present.

Mayor Brown moved, seconded by Mr. Kintner to approve the minutes as written for November 15, 2021. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

An application was submitted from Scott & Erin Langevin, 2 Linden Place, Cincinnati, OH 45227 originally submitted Nov. 5th and updated on Nov. 29th to repaint the exterior of the house, replace all exterior windows, replace the gutters/downspouts, replace the front porch soffit, and replace the garage door that are all showing visible signs of deterioration.

Findings of the Building Department:

2 Linden Place is included in the Elzner and Anderson Buildings and defined as a Landmark in Mariemont City code ordinance section 151.075.

The ARB on August 16, 2021 approved the use of Downpour (PPG1010-5) for the 3845 Beech St. which is included in the same cluster of homes in the Elzner and Anderson Buildings above.

The areas seeking ARB approval are in dire need of maintenance as noted by the homeowner.

Relevant to this request, Mariemont code states the following:

§ 151.075 HISTORIC DISTRICT.

(F)(9) Elzner and Anderson Buildings, 1-4 Linden Place, including garage area, 3845 and 3855 Beech Street, and 6576-6596 west of Beech Street on the north side of Wooster Pike

(H)(1) *Limitations on issuance of building and demolition permits.* No construction, reconstruction, alteration demolition, or removal of any structure or significant exterior architectural feature, including painting and staining, and including signage, thereof to any listed landmark structure or any other building within a historic district shall be undertaken prior to obtaining a certificate of appropriateness from the Architectural Review Board (see §§ [151.021](#)(E) and [151.025](#)) and a permit from the Building Commissioner, if appropriate.

(H)(2) *Regulations governing site modifications: Standards for review: design requirements for certificate of appropriateness.* The Architectural Review Board, in deciding whether to issue a certificate of appropriateness, shall determine that the application under consideration promotes, preserves, and enhances the distinctive historical integrity of the landmark structure as set forth in division (F) above, as well as the historical village character of the community and would not be at variance with existing structures within that portion of the district in which the structure is or is proposed to be located. In conducting its review, the Board shall make examination and give consideration to the elements of the application including, but not necessarily limited to:

(j) Exterior detail and relationships shall take into consideration compatibility and appropriateness of design and details, including all projecting and receding elements of the exterior, including, but not limited to, porches, overhangs, and the horizontal or vertical expression which is conveyed by these elements. Signage shall also consider the above;

Mr. Langevin said they are proposing to repaint the house in its existing color of pure white, which it has been for decades, but change the color (currently brown) to Rookwood shutter green. Swatches of the proposed colors were presented. In addition, they are proposing to replace all exterior windows on the home with white double-hung vinyl windows with exterior grids and beveled exterior molding to mimic the look of wood in compliance with Mariemont Historic District requirements. They also are proposing to replace the existing deteriorating gutters with Mastic .032 aluminum pre-finished 6" seamless gutters and 3"x4" pre-finished aluminum downspouts. Additionally, they are proposing to replace the current deteriorating plywood soffit on the front porch with standard white beadboard soffit. Lastly, they want to replace the garage door on the detached garage with a new white 16-panel non-insulated steel garage door in the style that would match the neighbor at 1 Linden Place.

The Board agreed to hold the paint color discussion for each submission last.

Mayor Brown moved, seconded by Dr. Lewis to approve the Request for Appropriateness for the replacement of the beadboard sheeting for the underside of the porch roof. On roll call; six ayes, no nays.

Mayor Brown moved, seconded by Mr. Bentley to approve the Request For Appropriateness for the 6" gutters and shape as proposed to be acceptable. On roll call; six ayes, no nays.

Mr. Langevin brought a sample of the ProVia proposed vinyl window for the members of ARB. Discussion ensued regarding the grid pattern and whether it would match what is currently there and that traditionally aluminum windows replace wood windows in the Historic District, but the ARB found these to be acceptable. Mr. Lockhart moved, seconded by Mr. Bentley to approve the Request for Appropriateness for the windows as submitted. On roll call; six ayes, no nays.

Mr. Holloway noted a contradiction in the Ordinance...Section 150.01(B) The following shall apply to Historic District only: (5) Garage doors shall be 16-panel wood or aluminum painted with approved dark brown color. The contradiction is that there are details specific for each historical grouping of homes which is not necessarily the appropriate colors or style for all the historic districts.

Mariemont Preservation Foundation Member Betty Clingerman distributed information on roll-up carriage style garage doors. Mr. Wren said MPF has gone through looking at manufactures that are producing similar products and their cost. This is a roll-up door as opposed to the carriage house swing open style door with more windows. Some of the products include insulated doors which Mr. Langevin said they were not interested in. There is no heat in the garage therefore an insulation door is not worth the cost. He also noted that this is a door that not many see thus they do not want to spend a great deal of money on it. They were satisfied with the choice they made from Overhead Door and the cost.

After further discussion, Mr. Bentley moved, seconded by Mayor Brown to table the request to allow the applicant to do further research on alternative options. On roll call; six ayes, no nays.

The discussion turned to paint colors. Mr. Wren pointed out that according to the Architectural Review Board Specifications this particular application the approved primary colors for the clapboard farm style cottages are:

XV. ELIZNER ANDERSON GROUP
3845 AND 3855 BEECH ST.
4576-6592 WOOSTER (NORTH SIDE)

A. HOUSES

COLONIAL FARMHOUSE COTTAGE
THESE BUILDINGS BELONG TO THE COTTAGE TYPE. THE HOUSES ARE CLAPBOARD AND SHOODING ROOFS DESCEND TO JUST OVER THE FIRST STORY. SOME OF THE DETAILS DISPLAY A MODIFICATION OF CLASSICAL ELEMENTS. SHUTTERS ARE TYPICAL AND GAMBREL ROOFS ARE COMMON ELEMENTS.

LOCATION	VALUE	COLORS	PRIME	A	B	
CLAPBOARD	LIGHT	SUNPORCH	19	CARPENTER'S LACE	13	HAMPION YELLOW
ROOF	SHSLES	COLORS VARY	COLORS VARY	COLORS VARY	COLORS VARY	
WINDMULLIONS	LTEST	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE
TRIM	MED	RENWICK ROSE BEIGE	3	ROOKWOOD BL/GR	10	CUPOLA YELLOW
SHUTTERS	MED	RENWICK ROSE BEIGE	3	ROOKWOOD BL/GR	10	CUPOLA YELLOW
ROOF EDGE TRIM	LIGHT	SUNPORCH	19	CARPENTER'S LACE	13	HAMPION YELLOW
BUTTRES	LIGHT	SUNPORCH	19	CARPENTER'S LACE	13	HAMPION YELLOW
BALINGOLTS	LIGHT	SUNPORCH	19	CARPENTER'S LACE	13	HAMPION YELLOW
DOOR TRIM	LTEST	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE
STORM DOOR	LTEST	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE
DOOR	LTEST	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE
WINDS	MED	RENWICK ROSE BEIGE	3	ROOKWOOD BL/GR	10	CUPOLA YELLOW
CHIMNEY	STONE	NATURAL	NATURAL	NATURAL	NATURAL	
COLONIAL DETAIL	LTEST	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE	4	CLASSICAL WHITE

THE COLOR SCHEMES ABOVE WILL ADD BOTH VARIETY TO THE INDIVIDUAL HOUSES WHILE CREATING HARMONY WITH THE OVERALL HISTORIC COMMUNITY.

	Prime	A	B
Clapboard	Sunporch	Carpenter's Lace	Cottage Cream (Hampton Yellow?)
Shutters	Renwick Rose Beige	Rookwood BL/GR	Cupola Yellow

The windows qualify as sash and mullions.

Mr. Langevin said the struggle is the house has always been painted the existing color and finds the Ordinance as written extremely restrictive. They would like to pair the white with Rookwood Green. Both he and his wife tried to make the suggested color scheme work but they were not enthusiastic about the choices.

Mayor Brown said he struggles with the argument that the house has always been white. He does not believe it was originally white. Historical preservation is not about what is modern. It is about preserving that which was architecturally of an earlier age. Mr. Langevin said the colors they are requesting are within the standard color palate from that time period. Additionally, several variances have already been granted. It was also the color the house was when the Village went on the Registry of National Historic Places. Mayor Brown said the ARB has been rightly called out for allowing those variances. The Board is attempting to right the ship back to a more uniform stringent idea of what was originally in place. Mr. Langevin said the variances have been granted in just the past year – it is hard for homeowners to figure out what is going on. We are looking for consistency and fairness.

Mr. Wren suggested making a compelling case for a new color palate which keeps in mind the adjacent properties and the approved palates. If a different color scheme is allowed in, it will undermine the current documents. Discussion ensued over the past granting of variances, and the lack of modern colors for homeowners to choose from. It is frustrating for homeowners to buy a home they like only to find out that the color is non-conforming. Surrounding neighbors voiced that they all respect the historic integrity, they just want additional choices.

Mayor Brown moved, seconded by Mr. Kintner to table the matter of applicant's color request pending the construction of a new color palate that works in conjunction with the exiting three color palate currently approved. Mr. Wren questioned who would perform the work and who would pay for it. The endeavor is asked to be completed by March 2022. On roll call; six ayes, no nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:26 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Mr. John Bentley
Secretary